

# COMPARATIVE LITERATURE IN FAULKNER'S *A ROSE FOR EMILY* AND PRAMOEDYA'S *PANGGIL SAJA AKU KARTINI*

ImaMasofa

[imamasofa@gmail.com](mailto:imamasofa@gmail.com)

SPM UNGGULAN AMANATUL UMMAH

## Abstract

This article analyzes comparative literature in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*. The researcher analyzes comparative literature that uses American School to compare how the society's role effects to the main characters in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* by analyzing similarities and differences of two stories. The study aims to compare two different literary works coming from two different cultures, nationalities, and historical background. Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* have same backgrounds of women's life. Kartini in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* and Emily in Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* are from noble that rule Kartini and Emily. This article attempts to find similarities and dissimilarities of the woman in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*. The results of this research can be formulated as follows: 1) the similarities are that both Emily and Kartini are from noble family. 2) The differences are that Kartini in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* can influence women at the time to get their right, but Emily in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* lives in fear because of her society rule.

**Keywords:** *Comparative Literature, American School, Backgrounds of Women's Life*

## A. Introduction

Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* have different cultures that are Indonesia and America. This research analyzes comparison on how the society's role has profound effected to the main characters. Emily is Colonel Sartoris's daughter. She is from noble family at the time. But she is isolated because her father refuses her relationship. This quotation in Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* describes that Emily is isolated.

Alive, Miss Emily had been a tradition, a duty, and a care; a sort of hereditary obligation upon the town, dating from that day in 1894 when Colonel Sartoris, the mayor who fathered the edict that no Negro woman should appear on the streets without an apron remitted her taxes, the dispensation dating from the death of her father on into perpetuity. No that Miss Emily would have accepted charity. Colonel Sartoris invented an involved tale to the effect that Miss Emily's father had loaned money to the town, which the town, as a matter of business, preferred this way of repaying. Only a man of Coloner Sartoris's generation and thought could have invented it, and

only a woman could have believed it..( <https://flightline.highline.edu>)

The quotation indicates that Emily is isolated since she was a child because of her father. Her relationship to other is limited, even her father forbid her to marry.

Kartini in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* is isolated from her environment. Even Kartini is from a noble family. Kartini is described in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* that can be seen in this following quotation:

Dan tentulah bahwa pada mulanya Bupati Ario Sosroningrat tak kan menduga bahwa pendidikan Eropa yang secumil diberikannya kepada Kartini, tidak membuat ia lebih maju, dari hanya bisa bicara Belanda dan meniru tata cara Belanda sedikit-sedikit. Ia kira pendidikan Barat secumil itu sudah layak diberikan pada seorang anak perempuan. Tapi Kartini ingin lebih jauh dari hanya Sekolah Rendah. Ia mendesak dan menuntut, ia memberontak dan memprotes. Tapi sikap ayahnya terhadap gadis-gadisnya tetap, tiada terbantahkan lagi (Pramoedya Ananta Toer: 2003)

The quotation indicates that Kartini is isolated since a child because the norms in the society at the time.

Susan Bassnett defines that comparative literature involves the study of text across cultures, interdisciplinary and that it is concerned with patterns of connection in literature and other studies across both time and space (Susan, 1993: 1). She adds that the true task of

comparative literature is to examine the phenomena of literature as a whole, to compare them, to group them, to enquire into the causes of them and to determine the results of them (1993: 1).

This study uses American school of comparative literature to know the similarities and the dissimilarities of Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*. According to Henry Remak, American school is to find out what lies / lie beyond the similarities and the dissimilarities. The similarities and dissimilarities can involve about social conditions, economic conditions, political conditions, cultures, architectures, beliefs, religions and so on. The things beyond the similarities and dissimilarities of the literary works are not limited to literature only but can go to other discipline (Susan, 1993: 31). The similarities of Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* are both characters are from rich family. The dissimilarities of Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* are both characters are from different nation and culture and reaction to face social condition that Kartini can change the social condition that time but Emily cannot change it. Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* have same background of women's life.

Kartini in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* and Emily in Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* are from noble, where the society's rule at the time made Kartini and Emily had to be isolated from other people. But time by time, Kartini and Emily grew with the different condition. Kartini faces society's rules and changes herself and influence her society. Moreover, Kartini is called as the emancipation's hero for women at the time. But society's rule influences Emily life with fear even people mocked and felt pity to Emily until her last day.

This article analyzes the similarities and dissimilarities of the woman in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* by using comparative literature to describe the similarities and dissimilarities of the woman in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* by using comparison social condition of two literary works. This research is expected to be one of the sources in Feminism approach by comparative literature methods. Practically, this research will give information about feminism in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*. The limitation is based on the characterization of the main characters in the novels. The researcher describes the influence of the society's rules to the main

characters in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*.

## **B. Research Method**

### **1. Research Design**

This researcher uses qualitative research by descriptive analysis and library research. The researcher uses some books including the novel itself as the primary sources and reads information of some internet sources and other sources as magazine and journal that aid this study to increase the knowledge.

#### **1. Research Object**

In this study, Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* are research objects.

#### **2. Source of Data**

There are two kinds of sources data in this research:

- a. The main data are taken from books, articles, journals, article and others which have relation with the main data.
- b. The supporting data are taken from books, articles, journals, article and others which have relationship with the main data.

#### **3. Technique of Collecting Data**

- a. First, close reading, reading the novels from the beginning to the end of the story. Collect

- b. Second, note taking, this activity will be done to write the data related with. This step is data will be sorted and filter by taking notes at once to obtain the main data and important data.
- c. Third, select notes to classify the data based on the formulation of statement problems stated in the statements of problems.
- d. Finally, interpret and discuss the data.

#### **4. Technique of Analyzing Data**

- a. This research combines the data in the form of literary text.
- b. After the novels have been analyzed, then the data will be described which have been discussed previously.
- c. The findings is described and analyzed deeply. The next chapter contains of discussion which will discuss the findings have been founded.

#### **5. Verification of the Data**

This research uses “expert triangulation”, when the researcher uses expert or master to check or validate of data obtain.

#### **C. Analysis and Discussion**

Susan Bassnett defines that comparative literature involves the study of text across cultures, interdisciplinary and

that it is concerned with patterns of connection in literature and other studies across both time and space (Susan, 1993: 1). She adds that the true task of comparative literature is to examine the phenomena of literature as a whole, to compare them, to group them, to enquire into the causes of them and to determine the results of them (1993: 1). According to Henry Remak, American school is to find out what lies / lie beyond the similarities and the dissimilarities. The similarities and dissimilarities can involve about social conditions, economic conditions, political conditions, cultures, architectures, beliefs, religions and so on. The things beyond the similarities and dissimilarities of the literary works are not limited to literature only but can go to other discipline (Susan, 1993: 31). This article analyzes the similarities and dissimilarities of the woman in Faulkner’s *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya’s *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* by using comparative literature to describe the similarities and dissimilarities of the woman in Faulkner’s *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya’s *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* by using comparison social condition of two literary works. This research is expected to be one of the sources in Feminism approach by comparative literature methods. Practically, this research will give information about feminism in Faulkner’s *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya’s *Panggil*

*Aku Kartini Saja*. The limitation is based on the characterization of the main characters in the novels. The researcher describes the influence of the society's rules to the main characters.

## 1. Similarities

Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* are from noble that their main characters family have influence society because their wealth but the main characters are isolated from society because of they are woman who don't have right to choose their love. Emily is Colonel Sartoris's daughter. She is from noble family at the time. But she is isolated because her father refuses her relationship. As the quotation in the short story

Alive, Miss Emily had been a tradition, a duty, and a care; a sort of hereditary obligation upon the town, dating from that day in 1894 when Colonel Sartoris, the mayor who fathered the edict that no Negro woman should appear on the streets without an apron remitted her taxes, the dispensation dating from the death of her father on into perpetuity. No that Miss Emily would have accepted charity. Colonel Sartoris invented an involved tale to the effect that Miss Emily's father had loaned money to the town, which the town, as a matter of business, preferred this way of repaying. Only a man of Coloner Sartoris's generation and thought could have invented it, and only a woman could have believed it". (<https://flightline.highline.edu>)

The quotation indicates that Emily is isolated since she was a child because of her father. Her relationship to other is limited, even her father forbid her to marry.

Kartini in Pramoedya's is isolated from her environment. Even Kartini is from a noble family that can be seen in this following quotation.

Dan tentulah bahwa pada mulanya Bupati Ario Sosroningrat takkan menduga bahwa pendidikan Eropa yang secumil diberikannya kepada Kartini, tidak membuat ia lebih maju, dari hanya bisa bicara Belanda dan meniru tatacara Belanda sedikit-sedikit. Ia kira pendidikan Barat secumil itu sudah layak diberikan pada seorang anak perempuan. Tapi Kartini ingin lebih jauh dari hanya Sekolah Rendah. Ia mendesak dan menuntut, ia memberontak dan memprotes. Tapi sikap ayahnya terhadap gadis-gadisnya tetap, tiada terbantahkan lagi. (Pramoedya Ananta Toer: 2003)

The quotation indicates that Kartini is isolated since a child because the norms in the society at the time.

## 2. Differences

Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* have different culture that are Indonesia and America. This research analyzes

comparison on how the society's role has profound effected to the main characters. Emily is Colonel Sartoris's daughter. She is from noble family in American that the culture is that woman is powerless though she is rich. Therefore she is isolated because her father refuses her relationship that can be seen in this following quotation.

Alive, Miss Emily had been a tradition, a duty, and a care; a sort of hereditary obligation upon the town, dating from that day in 1894 when Colonel Sartoris, the mayor who fathered the edict that no Negro woman should appear on the streets without an apron remitted her taxes, the dispensation dating from the death of her father on into perpetuity. No that Miss Emily would have accepted charity. Colonel Sartoris invented an involved tale to the effect that Miss Emily's father had loaned money to the town, which the town, as a matter of business, preferred this way of repaying. Only a man of ColonerSartoris's generation and thought could have invented it, and only a woman could have believed it".(<https://flightline.highline.edu>)

The quotation indicates that Emily is isolated since she was a child because of her father. Her relationship to other is limited, even her father forbid her to marry.

Kartini in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* is isolated from her environment. Even Kartini is from a noble family from Indonesia. In Indonesian culture, woman is powerless but Kartini is brave to struggle her freedom to speak

tough she is isolated, she struggles her right by writing a book that tells about woman's struggle that is described in this following quotation.

"... Ia kira pendidikan Barat secumil itu sudah layak diberikan pada seorang anak perempuan. Tapi Kartini ingin lebih jauh dari hanya Sekolah Rendah. Ia mendesak dan menuntut, memberontak dan memprotes. Tapi sikap ayahnya terhadap gadis-gadisnya tetap, tiada terbantahkan lagi".(Pramoedya Ananta Toer : 2003)

The quotation indicates that Kartini is isolated since a child because the norms in the society at the time. The girls are powerless traditionally, but Kartini does not want to experience that. She wants to join a higher education to empower the her life.

Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* have same background of women's life. Kartini in Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* and Emily in Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* are from noble, where the society's rule at the time made Kartini and Emily had to be isolated from other people. But time by time, Kartini and Emily grew with the different condition. Kartini faces society's rules and changes herself and influence her society. Moreover, Kartini is called as the emancipation's hero for women at the time. But society's rule influences Emily's life with fear even

people mocked and felt pity to Emily until her last day.

Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily*, Emily is a member of a family of the antebellum Southern aristocracy. After the civil war, the family falls into hard times. Emily's father isolates her and she does not have right to determine her life by herself because of the society norm. Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*, Kartini has high status in the society. Kartini is isolated from the environment because of the norms at the time. Kartini by herself learns about literacy, then she realizes that women equality at the time was so bad.

#### D. Conclusion

This study uses American school of comparative literature to know the similarities and the dissimilarities of Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*. The similarities of Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja* are both characters are from rich family. The dissimilarities of Faulkner's *A Rose For Emily* and Pramoedya's are both characters are from different nation and culture and reaction to face social condition that Kartini can change the social condition that time but Emily can not change it.

#### References

- Baldick. 1990. *Abandoning Character*. London: London University Press.
- Bassnett, Susan. 1993. *Comparative Literature A Critical Introduction*. UK: Blackwell Publishers.
- Denzin, Norman K; Lincoln, Yvona, 1994. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Hook, Bell. 2000. *Feminism is for Everybody*. New Zealand: South End Press.
- Hudson, W.H. 1958. *An introduction to the study of literature*. New York: Harper and Row Publisher
- Koscher, Adeline Carie. 2006. *The New Woman Novelist and the Redefinition of the Female: Marriage, Sexuality, and Motherhood*. USA: dissertation.com
- Masofa, Ima, 2013. *American Dream in Jeffrey Archer's Kane and Abel and John Steinbeck's The Grapes of Wrath*. Journal Fahum :UINSA.
- Offen, Karen M. 2000. *European Feminisms*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Toer, Pramoedya Ananta. 2003. *Panggil Aku Kartini Saja*. Jakarta Timur: Lentera Dipantara

#### INTERNET SOURCES:

<https://flightline.highline.edu> PDF *A Rose For Emily* by Faulkner

[http://www.studymode.com/topic/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily](http://www.studymode.com/topic/Faulkner's%20A%20Rose%20For%20Emily)

<https://www.amazon.com/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily>

<https://www.grin.com/document/304496>

[https://www.studymode.com/essays/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily /](https://www.studymode.com/essays/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily/)

<https://sites.google.com/a/umn.edu/histo>

<https://www.barnesandnoble.com/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily>

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Causes\\_of\\_](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Causes_of_)

<http://jurnalfahum.uinsby.ac.id/index.ph>

<https://www.123helpme.com/search.asp?tex>

<http://easyopinions.blogspot.com/2008/12>

<http://schroederaplang.blogspot.com/2015>

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily>

<https://propertibazar.com/article/intern>

<http://jurnalfahum.uinsby.ac.id/index.ph>

<https://www.123helpme.com/search.asp?tex>

<https://www.skilledsurvival.com/survivin>

<http://jurnalfahum.uinsby.ac.id/index.ph>

<http://cvhs-english-2.wikispaces.com/Gra>

<http://jurnalfahum.uinsby.ac.id/index.ph>

<https://www.reddit.com/r/ChoosingBeggars>

<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/femail/articl>

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily>

<https://www.studymode.com/essays/Faulkner's A Rose For Emily>

