

Print media innovation in the digital era: disruptive challenges or opportunities?

Eko Pamuji^{*}), Rachmah Ida, Mustain

Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Airlangga

Dharmawangsa Dalam Street, Surabaya, Indonesia

Email: eko.pamuji-2017@fisip.unair.ac.id, Phone: +62 31 5034015

How to Cite This Article: Pamuji, E. *et al.* (2022). Print media innovation in the digital era: disruptive challenges or opportunities?. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi*, 6(3). doi: 10.25139/jsk.v6i3.5311

Received: 05-07-2022, Revision: 23-09-2022, Acceptance: 31-10-2022, Published online: 15-11-2022

Abstract The newspaper industry (print media) has many difficulties in the digital era. Print media's demise has been facilitated by the emergence of digital media, specifically new internet-based media. Newspapers and other traditional mass media outlets have issues. Digital media is both a challenge and a threat to traditional media, particularly newspapers. Due to these obstacles and dangers to print media, some publications have shut down, and others have switched to digital editions. This study aims to ascertain how the print media in East Java (Jawa Pos and Surya) retain their commercial viability under the continuing media digitalisation competition. With a Marxist Media perspective, this study employs a qualitative methodology. From July 2020 to July 2022, researchers used in-depth interviews and direct observation to collect data. East Java newspapers Jawa Pos and Surya were the focus of this study. The study's findings demonstrate that the media products produced by these two media businesses engage in significant product commodification to create worldwide products. To produce global products, the two media have also produced media products. These products include news content that employs a single source for three different media types: print, electronic (television, radio), and internet media.

Keywords: print media; innovation; digital media; disruptive media

INTRODUCTION

This research departs from the phenomenon of print media experiencing difficult times in the era of digital technology. Newspapers, as a whole, face great challenges in the digital world. Newspapers face competitors who offer cheaper or more efficient products and services. Some of these competitors are other newspapers in a different media form currently in the same social and technical area as newspapers. Other competitors are newcomers to the news market. The same competitors are also "hungry" for the advertising revenue that newspapers "traditionally" enjoy (Gurevitch & Curran, 1996).

^{*}) Corresponding Author

Regarding the significance of the Marxist theory of media, Christian Fuchs, in his book *Marx and the Political Economy of the Media*, explains that Marxist media and communication are not only relevant in the current era but have been for so long because communication has always been embedded in the structure of inequality in class society. Christian Fuchs argues that Marx is always relevant in today's media and communication analysis (Fuchs & Mosco, 2012). Bhaskar Sunkara, in his writings published in *The Guardian* magazine, describes the rise of Karl Marx's ideas, assessing that Karl Marx's ideas are more relevant in the 21st century and beyond than before so that they can be used as a basis for analysing economic problems, especially regarding adult capitalism. To explain this, Bhaskar Sunkara illustrates the story of *Futurama*, which is a new path for the development of the future world. Evidence that can be seen, after the second world war, part of the *Futurama* story became a reality. Although capitalism is developing unevenly, there is a boost to economic growth and the sharing of wealth that was previously unimaginable. Researchers will also use the illustration above to reveal how the future of print media is currently entering difficult times (Sunkara, 2013).

Table 1. Total Print Media Advertising Expenditure
 Print Media Advertising Shopping

| | |
|------|---------------|
| 2013 | 25 Trillion |
| 2017 | 21,8 Trillion |

Source: (Reily, 2017)

The Nielsen Consumer & Media View survey in 2017 stated that not only has the number of readers decreased (Table 1), but advertising spending on print media has also decreased. In January-September 2017, the total print media advertising spending was IDR 21.8 trillion, a decrease of 13% compared to the same period in 2013, IDR 25 trillion. Print media producers also decreased by 23%. Nielsen noted 268 print media in 2013 but dropped sharply to only 192 media in 2017. The decline influenced this figure in the number of tabloid and magazine producers, which decreased by 92 units, and only two newspaper products were declared out of business. Nielsen found that print media is still more popular than digital media (Reily, 2017). Table 2 presents data from the AC Nielsen survey.

The description of the survey results and media research on Tables 1 and 2 illustrates that the challenges of the digital era's newspaper industry (print media) are very heavy. The birth of digital media, namely new internet-based media, has contributed to the decline of print media. Technological advances make the news quickly circulated. Print media such as newspapers and magazines cannot compete quickly with electronic media, television, and the internet. Ishwara also said that the clash between print media and internet-

based media, or what is often referred to as new media, is getting worse. Through online journalism, anyone can explore news or information without space and time constraints. Information becomes very fast and easy to access (Ishwara, 2011). As in big cities worldwide, when internet penetration increases, print media circulation decreases (Tapsell, 2019).

Table 2. AC Nielsen Survey Results

| Newspaper Purchase | |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| 2013 | 28% |
| 2017 | 20% |
| Gaining Access to Information | |
| TV | 96% |
| Street Billboard | 52% |
| Internet | 43% |
| Radio | 37% |
| Print media | 8% |
| Print Media Penetration | |
| Newspaper | 83% |
| Tabloids | 17% |
| Magazine | 15% |
| Number of Printed Media | |
| 2013 | 268 |
| 2017 | 192 |

Source: Data processed by researchers (2021)

Online media differs from conventional publishing and broadcasting (newspapers, radio, television). They treat the news like a lecture in one direction, from the giver to the recipient, who becomes the audience. They determine the news. In the digital era, reporting and future production will be more of a conversation or a seminar. The line between consumers and producers is blurred. Technology has enabled millions of people to speak freely and be heard (Ishwara, 2011). Digital technology has created a new business model for most mainstream media in Indonesia. Despite the potential of digitalisation to bring about greater diversity, industrialist media remains the dominant business model in the early 21st century (Tapsell, 2019).

Problems arise in conventional mass media such as newspapers. The presence of digital media is a challenge as well as a threat to conventional media, especially newspapers. These challenges and threats impact the existence of print media, so some newspapers are closed, and some have moved to digital versions. The real impact of the proliferation of digital media is the decline in public interest in newspapers (print media), both in selling advertising services and newspapers. This digital technology revolution causes people to find and send the news quickly, so there is effective communication (Feriyanto & Triana, 2015). Conditions like this further impact the newspaper industry, namely the durability and viability of the newspaper business. This is where the panic in the mass media industry, especially print media, started over the proliferation of digital

media. This condition is a new phenomenon that befell the media industry.

Media convergence became an important issue in the industry in the mid-2000s. Big media companies are starting to set up platforms they did not produce before digital television stations, online news and social media sites, citizen journalism, and even new print media. They believe that to respond to the fragmentation caused by the internet and to survive financially in the digital age, and they must agilely metamorphose into a multi-platform company (Tapsell, 2019; Susilo & Putranto, 2018; Susilo et al., 2021).

The storm of newspaper closures also hit the English-language newspaper Jakarta Globe. The newspaper was first published on 12 November 2008, closed on 15 December 2015 and then focused on the online edition (online media). Even more interesting is the case of Koran Tempo, which since 11 October 2015, has stopped the Sunday edition of Koran Tempo. The closure has led to a decrease in the number of prints of the Sunday edition. The Chief Editor of Koran Tempo, Daru Priyambodo, said there was an imbalance in the number of prints between the regular and Sunday editions. The regular edition is usually 80,000 to 90,000 copies, but the Sunday edition is only 60,000. This condition causes the cost of printing, so the management of Koran Tempo has decided to close it down (DetikInet, 2017). Digital media has shifted people's consumption patterns towards news or information.

The prediction of print media having a gloomy and even dead period has happened for a long time. This is a problematic phenomenon in the world of mass media today, namely the collapse of print media. Around the 19th century, when radio was born and used as a new, more powerful mass media, some experts stated that print media would be erased by electronic media-radio broadcasts (Fidler, 2003). The prediction uses a very basic argument, namely that radio mass media is easier to reach audiences without using human distribution networks. The audience very easily accepts radio broadcasts because they use a frequency network in the air. The range of distribution is also farther and faster than print mass media.

Digital technology continues to boost the number of internet users in Indonesia. The Indonesian Internet Service Providers Association (APJII) survey results in 2017 stated that the number of internet users in Indonesia reached 143 million (Apjiki, 2019). This number increased to 150 million people in 2019 based on a survey by the British survey institute wearesocial.com. Data from APJII states that of the total population of Indonesia, around 162 million people, the majority of internet users, as much as 72.41 per cent, are still from the urban community. Its use has gone further, not only to communicate but also to buy goods, order transportation, do business and work. Based on its geographical area, Javanese people are most exposed to the internet, 57.70 per cent. Then Sumatra was 19.09 per cent, Kalimantan 7.97

per cent, Sulawesi 6.73 per cent, Bali-Nusa 5.63 per cent, and Maluku-Papua 2.49 per cent.

Newspapers have two sources of cash flow: from subscriptions, the money paid when someone buys the newspaper and selling advertising space in newspapers. Of the two, the latter is usually by far the most important. In American newspapers, for example, 80 per cent of revenue comes from these sources. One of the most important elements of the advertisements found in newspapers is the classifieds section, which accounts for between 25 and 50 per cent of US newspaper advertising revenues and about 30 per cent of the total revenue. These classifieds are dominated by three categories: jobs, cars, and housing. Another major advertising staple for USA newspapers is image ads ordered by local retailers, which have many of the same localised features as good classifieds. National display advertising is relatively unimportant in the US print media, and elsewhere, it is of secondary importance to the local print media (Gurevitch & Curran, 1996).

Digital technology is seen as threatening the existence of newspapers, particularly for their strong historical commitment to a wide range of news and current issues and their function as a forum for public debate. Since these are two central aspects of contemporary democratic political life, it seems plausible that the development of the internet poses a threat to the deeply imperfect contemporary public sphere. As to how serious the threat is and whether any substantive alternatives will emerge, it is too early to say, but the initial evidence is not good. Technology that has been proven to have the potential to solve many of the problems of the mass media seems to be turning into something that makes the newspaper business worse (Curran, 2000). Based on these problems, this study aims to determine how the print media in East Java (Jawa Pos and Surya) maintain their business continuity with the media capitalisation model they do in the media digitalisation competition.

METHODOLOGY

This study uses a qualitative method with a Marxist Media perspective. Qualitative research begins by using assumptions and an interpretive framework or theory that can shape or influence the study being researched. The research process involves significant efforts, asking questions and procedures, collecting specific data from participants, analysing data inductively from specific themes to general themes and interpreting the meaning of the data (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011; Creswell & Poth, 2017). Neuman also explained that qualitative research is not tied to any single scientific discipline, nor does it have a distinct set of pure methods (Neuman, 2013).

This research targets East Java newspapers, namely Jawa Pos and Surya. The research focuses on revealing the resilience of Jawa Pos and Surya in the digital era. Jawa Pos and Surya were chosen to be

research targets because they are considered to represent media economy institutions from different media business group models. Researchers classify Jawa Pos as a media business institution “independent” as a holding company, while Surya is a subsidiary of the Kompas-Gramedia group. Meanwhile, the selection of media locations in East Java was caused more by economic conditions in the province, which has a typical regional business atmosphere outside of central Jakarta. Jawa Pos is a media business company located outside Jakarta, while Surya is a business organisation outside Jakarta that still has links with business owners in central Jakarta. This research involves subjects (main resource persons) and informants (supporting resource persons). Table 3 is a list of subjects and informants in this study.

Table 3. Subject and Informant

| Subject |
|--|
| Dahlan Iskan (founder of Jawa Pos Group) |
| Leak Koestiya (Java Pos Group Director) |
| Abdul Rokhim (Chief Editor / Person in Charge of Jawa Pos) |
| Prof. Muhammad Nuh (Chairman of the Press Council 2019-2022) |
| Herman Darmo (General Manager of Surya) |
| Budiono Sudarsono (CEO of Kumparan.com) |
| Atmaji Sapto Anggoro (Tirto.id) |

| Informant: |
|---------------------------|
| Jawa Pos Business Section |
| Surya Business Section |
| Newspaper agent |

Source: Data Processing by Author 2021

Data were collected using in-depth interviews and direct observations conducted by researchers from July 2020 to July 2022. Interviews were conducted with subjects and informants to reveal information and information as well as any data that supports the research. The data collected is narrative data in the form of statements or writings from the subjects and informants. Also, written data from subjects and informants either in writing or in other archive forms. At the research site, the researcher met with the subjects and supporting informants to participate in the study.

Direct observations were made to produce notes during the research. Through direct observation, the researcher came to the research location, namely Jawa Pos and Surya, by meeting several subjects and supporting informants to record all the data needed in the study. This direct observation allows researchers to observe or directly see what is in the research target. These observations are based on the research objectives and research statements. In this study, the researcher takes the position of an observer, what has been done by Jawa Pos and Surya so that until now, the print media institution can survive in the digital era. Field observations were carried out for two

years, from June 2020 to July 2022. The units to be analysed in Jawa Pos and Surya are media conglomeration, digital technology, media ownership, editorial staff, and production equipment as a reflection of media capitalisation. These things become an important part that is influential in a print media business institution. Researchers obtained primary data on developing mass media as the object of research, the data in the form of interviews with informants and supporting documents.

The data obtained from interviews and observations in the field by observing the research object directly is to be explored and analysed, collected and then coded according to the sub-chapters in the interview. The data is then categorised and described according to the research needs. If it is felt that the data is lacking in the categorisation, it will be carried out with in-depth interviews. The data analysis method used was a general analysis strategy by prioritising the case description. This case description is used to analyse the results of interviews and observations found in the field.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Digitisation and Sustainability of Mass Media: Surya in the Kompas Group Company

Kompas Gramedia Group is one of the largest media groups in Indonesia. Kompas Gramedia Group started its birth with the publication of the monthly magazine *Intisari* on 17 August 1963, which was initiated by 4 (four) people, namely Petrus Kanisius and Jacob Oetama, along with J. Adisubrata and Irawati SH. 3 (three) years later, Kompas newspaper was published, which until now. Kompas Gramedia Group can maintain its business by carrying out the concept of political economy from Mosco (2009).

Mosco divides the political economy into commodification, spatialisation, and structuration. Commodification is transforming goods with their exchange value, spatialisation is the transformation of distance with time or the process of institutional extension, and structuring is the process of structure with social institutions (Mosco, 2009). These three concepts are interrelated; where each media system will continue to create media innovations followed by media technology to result in the transformation of goods with their exchange values, causing an expansion of distance and time caused by meeting the needs of the community and ultimately affecting the structure of social institutions.

The spatialisation concept is carried out to ensure that Kompas Gramedia Group can survive and improve mass media and non-media products to penetrate the boundaries between countries (borderless world). Kompas Gramedia Group is one of the 12 major media in Indonesia. To maintain this company, Kompas Gramedia Group commodifies mass media products and performs spatialisation to

overcome the limitations of space and time, thus achieving globalisation.

In media systems such as Surya under the auspices of the media company Kompas Group, certain types of news content production are found based on different media technologies such as print media, television, radio, internet, and so on. However, these types are often subdivided into different "media forms", for example, print media into books, magazines or newspapers. Print media has also transformed digitally with the development of technology and information, such as the emergence of Kompas TV. These are all tools for the distribution of different news information. The integration of this information develops according to the advancement of mass media technology. In other words, disseminating mass media information will adapt to new information technology.

Globalisation also refers to the increasingly global relationship of culture, society and economic activity. The term can also refer to the transnational circulation of ideas, language, and popular culture. Kompas Gramedia group, to provide quality reading and open up the Indonesian people's horizons on the first media product, *Intisari*, in 1963. At that time, this magazine was published in black and white without a cover and 128 pages. At the beginning of its publication, this magazine received a good response from the public and was published with a circulation of up to 11,000 copies. Three years later, in 1966, Kompas newspaper was published as a newspaper to fight against the communist press. The name KOMPAS is a gift from the First President of Indonesia, President Soekarno, which means direction. The following is the development of Kompas Gramedia Group in developing the media industry to create global products.

Talking about the long context of digitising newspapers, in this decade, a discourse has re-questioned the viability of newspapers. The first printed newspaper, *The Relation*, dates back to 1605 and is published weekly in Germany, which is the product of the Guttenberg printing press changing the spread of information flows (Lotriet, 2018; Susilo, 2021). Since then, people have received the knowledge of the world, their communities and remote places mainly from newspapers, up to and including the fourth industrial revolution.

Newspaper circulation is increasing in developing regions such as the Middle East (Iwilade, 2017; You et al., 2017) but decreased in more developed countries such as Europe and America (Pruckner & Sausgruber, 2013). Meanwhile, in South Africa, the international trend of declining circulation figures is also experienced with print media, which seems problematic (Lotriet, 2018), the same as what was faced by the post-2010 Indonesian print media industry. The presence of fast, easy, and cheap broadband internet that reaches all corners of Indonesia has significantly declined circulation (Khadziq, 2016). The increasing popularity and growing phenomenon of digital media are changing the market landscape significantly, and the dire

consequences for newspaper publishers are that the migration to digital media is strategically managed. Calls for global academics and journalism activists to: "stop the printing press!" (Chyi & Tenenboim, 2019; O'Sullivan et al., 2017; Thurman & Fletcher, 2018) became a global discourse that re-questioned the extent to which traditional print media were able to survive.

In response to these challenges and questions, the condition of the Indonesian media industry is slowly but surely shifting the pattern of media focus from previously relying on the printed version to what O'Sullivan (2017) calls "Digital Life" as an excess of "Death of Print". or the death of the printing press. The strategy carried out by *Harian Surya* as a subsidiary of Kompas Gramedia cannot be separated from the vision and anxiety of the founder, Jakob Oetama, about the future of print media. A slow but sure wave of change is present in the body of the media corporation, which the senior journalists of PK are also nurturing. Ojong. Since 1981, Kompas Gramedia has expanded by building the Hotel Santika, which operates in the hospitality and tourism industry, as a lifeboat from the possible collapse of the newspaper industry.

Jakob Oetama's vision and anxiety became a reality in 2010 when the decline in the circulation of print-based newspapers was sure to occur, and the shift in digital media consumption increased sharply (Chyi & Ng, 2020; Gore, 2014). In the words of Febby Mahendra Putra, News Director of the Kompas Gramedia Tribune Network, *Tribunnews.com*, as a transformation domain for *Persda* (Kompas Regional Press), was established or born ten years ago on 17 March 2010 to be exact as an anticipatory measure for declining trends in the print media industry. Febby emphasised that at that time, Kompas Gramedia estimated the possibility of disruption and a shift to digital. In its organisational structure, *Surya* is in the Tribune structure and builds its online portal in the *Surya.co.id*, *Suryamalang.com*, *tribunjember.com*, and *tribunmadura.com* channels.

Researchers seek to transcend the dichotomy between the stagnant traditional print media industry and the more vibrant digital media. Researchers find that the materiality of printed objects, and the structures and culture built around them, serve as a matrix that facilitates innovation, enabling traditional newspapers to coexist with digital media. In this case, *Surya*, with his Tribune Network's formation, replied that there is no binary dichotomy of classical assumptions that contradicts the two. The mere presence of digitisation through *tribunnews.com* leads to innovation from the anxiety of the print media in guarding its future.

This synergistic relationship creates an increasingly complex media ecosystem. To understand the complexities of this emerging media environment, we need to get past the narrative of decline, which narrows our perspective in counterproductive ways. In reality, on the ground, researchers realise that the decline in the dominance of

print media is in front of the eyes of media owners. The western world market, where penetration of media exposure has long been the benchmark and reading literacy is the dominant one, leaves little room for the growth of traditional print media (O'Sullivan et al., 2017; Michelle & Susilo, 2021).

Data released by the World Association of Newspapers and News Publishers (WANIFRA) reports that the global circulation of printed newspapers is increasing slowly, rising 2% from 2012 to 2014 with steady revenues (\$163 billion) and readership of 2.5 billion (adults) (O'Sullivan et al., 2017). Meanwhile, digital readers, who have become a booming and hot topic in various discussions, still occupy a third (800 million Internet users) of printed newspapers (2.4 billion). Meanwhile, 93% of newspaper revenue comes from print media, which is estimated to be the main source of media income and is slowly shifting to digitalisation. The development of digitisation has grown significantly, but print remains the dominant format.

In line with the WANIFRA data, Febby Mahendra Putra, in an interview, explained that it was not necessarily covered by the decline in income from print media by digital and audio-visual income, but slowly. However, surely Febby claimed that in five years, the decline in revenue from print media had been covered by the success of Kompas. Gramedia shifts its media logic from traditional print-based to digital. The statement from Febby indicates that despite the statistical trend, the final decline in newspaper narratives is conceptually wrong. Although media history shows several examples of communication platforms that have slumped to death (e.g. fax machines), the arrival of new media leads to a restructuring of the media ecology. Historian Adrian Johns, discussing the history of books, shows how actors in each era of media evolution redefined printed stories to suit their contemporary needs (Johns, 2015).

Centralisation, Digitisation, and Efficiency: New Jawa Pos Strategy and Concept

The process of centralisation, digitisation and efficiency at the Jawa Pos Group is seriously shown to shift digitally starting in 2019. In his speech, Leak Kustiya, President Director of Jawa Pos, said from the beginning that the Jawa Pos Group industry differentiation was not only in the media field but also in various fields of energy, hotels and other services. The orientation built by Jawa Pos is how to see opportunities that can be taken and make maximum efforts in developing the core business of Jawa Pos.

The line between traditional print and digital news has been blurred in complicated ways. Digital technology is used to produce print editions, while much of the digital content comes from print media or editorials created for print. As print and digital media form two dimensions of news production and distribution, news's characteristics, features, and capabilities intersect (Pratopo &

Kusajibrata, 2018). Jawa Pos considers that everything new must be presented and complement each other. Business orientation had become a very strong aura in the Jawa Pos industry. The digital niche before 2019 was considered insignificant and resulted in Jawa Pos focusing on building a business strategy based on technology infrastructure and the sustainability of print media production.

Leak Kustiya highlighted that, in fact, print media, with its production costs, continue to increase, but until now, it is still well supported by various other business lines. Leak Kustiya's belief in the optimism of the print media industry is inversely proportional to the reality of the decline in print media globally. The decline in the number of traditional print newspapers, widely described as unstoppable, is starting to show signs of change with an unexpected back-migration — from online to print. However, Jawa Pos's belief in the survival of print media is in line with the facts that occurred in Newsweek (a weekly news magazine published in New York City and circulated worldwide), whose circulation became the second largest in the United States after Time in circulation and advertising revenue was forced to reverse the conventional print tradition. Its new media-oriented owner closed the print version at the end of 2012 (Daniel & Hagey, 2012). However, the frontal action must eventually bear fruit in failure. In March 2014, Newsweek launched a weekly print edition, positioning itself for premium pricing and higher quality paper than time. What Newsweek has done has resulted in unexpected profits (O'Sullivan et al., 2017).

Another indicator of the continued relevance of print, as the Jawa Pos group is doing, is the recent spate of investments by business figures in newspapers in the United States. Warren Buffett's Berkshire Hathaway started its program of buying regional and local US newspapers in 2012, and by early 2014 had spent more than USD 400 million (O'Sullivan et al., 2017). Some of these newspapers rejected Berkshire Hathaway's investment and accused it of being a "cleanup" of cheap assets for short-term turnover, a peripheral to its total interests. However, reports show Berkshire investing further, retooling the newspaper, experimenting with digital technology, and adding titles, with an annual after-tax return of 10% (O'Sullivan et al., 2017).

Centralised and efficient flow of information and human resources into various findings presented in various digital shift models from conventional media (Ashuri, 2016; Khadziq, 2016; Pratopo & Kusajibrata, 2018; Prihartono, 2016). In Indonesia and the global media arena, media conglomeration (centralisation of ownership) presents various efficiencies and centralisation of human resources, making the information production process cheap and fast (Pratopo & Kusajibrata, 2018; Thurman & Fletcher, 2018).

Conditions in Australia, media magnate Rupert Murdoch has been criticised for owning the majority of the country's newspapers, with News Corp Australia accounting for 59% of all daily newspaper sales (Flew, 2013). Research shows that amid declining operating sales

figures, Australian newspaper circulation has the highest concentration in the democratic world (Lotriet, 2018). As a media house, the Independent News and Media (INM) has around 60% of the total local advertising spending in newspapers, while only 30% of the circulation. Independent newspapers are the exception to the rule today. The next question is whether the industry has sufficient diversity to guarantee healthy local media.

This question was answered in an interview with Leak Kustiya, Director of Jawa Pos. Leak said that in digitising to attract Generation Z for its sustainability, Jawa Pos applies the "Hyper-Local" concept. According to Leak, the Hyper-Local concept answers the challenges of digitalisation in the newspaper industry. According to Leak Kustiya, Jawa Pos finance is currently in a very healthy position and is not disturbed by the digitalisation process. The Hyper-Local concept of Jawa Pos addresses issues from the periphery, locally presented in digital spaces. Information from the outskirts of villages and wards is considered Leak's value for the digitisation of Jawa Pos. According to Leak, the Hyper-Local concept helps the growth of Jawapos.com readers. In Leak's calculation, there are one million loyal readers of Jawapos.com who faithfully access news through the digital channel. According to Leak, the number is more than the printed Jawa Pos readers. However, Leak highlighted that Jawa Pos's digital business achievements have not been able to be considered potential in terms of business value.

"But one million is just a little bit. Well, it is just that, Pak Eko, for example... *Eee*, for example, together with one million newspapers, with this leadership, sir, with one million online, sir. I see. So, one million is the same, and this is one million free newspapers. However, according to the Jawa Pos newspaper, that is one million people who collect it, 120 thousand per month. Well, in the end, sir, they made a different class which was selected, which then made yes, for example, *eee* bargaining in advertising and so on. It became very different *Pak Eko*," said Leak. (Personal Interview, Leak Kustiya, 11-10-2020)

Leak highlights that the one million online readers it conveys have no economic capitalisation value. In the digital world, newspapers face serious challenges. Newspapers come face-to-face with competitors who offer products and services at lower prices or more efficiently. In this perspective, Leak considers that online income has no business capitalisation value compared to print income. Some of these competitors are other newspaper companies. Others are media that currently find themselves in the same social and technical space as newspapers. Still, others are newcomers to the news market. The same competitors are also 'hungry' for advertising revenue, which newspapers have traditionally enjoyed (Gurevitch & Curran, 1996).

According to Leak, Jawa Pos already has a strong power in the print business, so when playing in the digital realm, the portion of the advertising cake is defeated by other players who number in the thousands.

"Yes, yes. *Eee* is a form of concern, sir. It is a form of concern that it is an e-print, so this print is e-the-star from everything in the holding unit, sir. Jawa Pos newspaper is the final one. Once in *ee* on social media events and so on, it has decreased quite a lot, sir. That means one thing, for example, cakes, cookies, cakes, and advertisements, which used to only stick to the newspaper, but then there were thousands of online media. Moreover, and that is the calculation method, it is very good, sir. So, for example, I want to post what kind of ad this is, for example, from Print In. It is already very machine all. Well, that inevitably reduces, making worries about how to save. However, in Jawa Pos, the foundation is still in the discourse, sir. So, eh, maybe this will disappear, this newspaper. Then we will move to, *ee* to digital, so, sir. Now, since there is no sign of this newspaper that he will lose money, the gesture of helping him will not be seen, sir." (Personal Interview, Leak Kustiya, 11-10-2020)

With a business orientation, it is clear that Leak's presentation regarding media digitisation has no economic value. However, something different was found in Jawa Pos HR Beky Subeky. Beky had a long career at Jawa Pos for more than 20 years as a photographer. Beky considers that major changes are taking place within Jawa Pos, especially digitalisation. Beky considers that this digital penetration and movement has changed all aspects of his main work pattern as a Jawa Pos photographer. Beky feels the demand for speed of work is a significant change in digitising media.

"Well, if *Mas Eko* asks if it has any relevance to the editorial policy, I think the editorial policy has changed because it demands the speed of photo submissions and photo coverage. That is all. So earlier, the photo that took place that night was taken tomorrow. This is life" (Personal Interview, Beky, 07-10-2020)

Beky considers that more editorial demands are imposed on him than in the early 2000s. The demands of the online market that take various angles quickly according to the wishes of online readers are felt by Beky to impact changing the working mode at Jawa Pos significantly. Beky highlighted the editorial's remarks, emphasising that anyone can become a photographer in today's era. The Photographer's exclusivity has faded, so the editorial demands to produce exclusive photos that are not the same as photos circulating in the digital world and social media.

“So our demands are, how to find an angle completely different from the common eye, you know.” (Personal Interview, Beky, 07-10-2020)

Beky’s explanation is slightly different from what Leak said regarding the absence of economic value in the online media industry. Beky considers that the existence of print from Jawa Pos is supported by the reliability and exclusivity of content that online media cannot present. Beky considers this defensive strategy to keep Jawa Pos strong regarding market value in the print industry.

Regarding the change in the mode of content production that demands to “look different” than what is available online, it actually brings efficiency, according to Beky, to keep up with digital trends that have entered the media world. Beky said that in stoppress news, photographers were no longer deployed with writing journalists. Written journalists are required to use their smartphones to take photos as a complement to news written to be posted in real-time on Jawapos.com. This HR efficiency is also considered the impact of digitisation on Beky as a photographer. Meanwhile, the demand for photographers is now also the ability to handle video as a videographer. Video and interactive are important features that distinguish traditional print media and online media.

From the perspective of Media Marxist Theory presented by Daniel Chandler, Economism (also called ‘Vulgar Marxism’) is a key feature of ‘Classical Marxism’ (orthodox or fundamentalist Marxism). In economism, the economic base of society is seen as determining everything in the superstructure, including social, political and intellectual awareness. Theories that place economic relations as the basic cause of social phenomena are also called materialist theories, and Marx’s version is also known as ‘historical materialism’.

Jawa Pos changed the process of creating news content with the demands of news speed on photographers as an excess of the economic interests promoted by Jawa Pos. Photographers such as in Beky’s narrative, who are no longer featured in the news – stopres news, shows the process of HR efficiency coupled with the demands of photographers who have videographer skills simultaneously for the sake of online news demands.

In addition, the economic interest in resource discipline can be seen in Beky’s narrative. Photographers as assets are encouraged to be able to create photo output products that are different from other online media and social media. This impetus solely stems from the demands of materialistic capital as a strategy to maintain the printed version of Jawa Pos customers from the swift and strong onslaught of online media, which was also expressed by Pratopo & Kusajibrata (2018); Rubawati (2018); Putranto (2019); Susilo et al. (2019).

Beky considers people who can become reporters who spread information to be in accordance with the New Threat (threat) for the survival of the print media. The strategy of upgrading itself is the choice of Jawa Pos HR to continue to survive in the midst of changing times. Tri Mulyono, Chief Editor of Harian Surya.

"Hmm okay. Not migrating, yes, not migrating from print to digital. So we converge. As implementation is that we quote it forcing all editorial teams and businesses to produce content from the editorial team. In business, he also has to look for digital accounts. So the quotes force our team to see what we do per digital production. Then from a digital account. However, do not forget to print. Because, until now, readers and accounts influence the editor, the influence is still strong when printed on the account it is still being printed, Mas. However, it is clear that the trend is indeed sloping, the digital ones are printed, but they have not reached the point yet, Mas." . (Personal Interview Tri Mulyono, 07-10-2020)

Tri Mulyono emphasised that what was happening was not the migration (exodus) of print media to digital media but a complementary process of convergence. Tri Mulyono realises that the trend of reading interest in the print edition continues to decline, and the elaboration between print and digital concepts is in the hands of the editor. Resistance from journalists was also encountered in the early days of digital application in Surya Daily.

"Well, at the beginning too, Mas, did you have time, did there ever exist, there were some resistances. Because it adds work. In the editor, for example, all reporters have to make seven pieces of digital content, and then they are still required to produce content for print. One angel, sir." (Personal Interview Tri Mulyono, 07-10-2020).

If in the print edition, the newsrooms are limited to the number of pages and are related to paper demand, in the digital world, these spaces become large areas and force journalists to work extra in presenting information in order to increase the number of reader visits, the more news, the better. There are also many opportunities for the legibility of digital media. This finding aligns with Chandler's concept of links in digital media consensus. Consequently, 'commercial media organisations must meet the needs of advertisers and produce products that maximise audiences (hence high content and entice readers to click on them), while media institutions whose revenues are controlled by institutions of power are oriented towards capital interests (Chandler, 2000). The base/superstructure model applied to

the mass media is associated with concern for ownership and control of the media.

What happened to Beky in Jawa Pos is relatively the same as what was applied to Harian Surya. Journalists are required to be able to take good photos, make videos, and even live on Facebook live. This demand is based on intense competition, which impacts changes in SOPs and journalists' work patterns.

"Then the third one, it seems that the last 4 or 5 years have required editors to make video content, Mas. So not only text and photos but also videos. Technically, we did at that time because we used the Facebook platform Mas, so there was an event or activity for the reporter's e-SOP, a Live Facebook meme. So, we borrowed Facebook's storage to accommodate videos. So, they live on Facebook as they used to when they were at the crime scene, and journalists came and took photos. No, it is a live video with Facebook, so it is a live Facebook live broadcast. We got there, and then in the newsroom, a video editing team downloaded the video content on Facebook's storage to be processed and converted to YouTube. In the last year, we had signal problems, for example. Finally, my friends also experience offline photos and offline videos. Record videos without having to go live on Facebook. In the last video, it was deposited into the newsroom and then processed again to be uploaded again to YouTube and on Facebook. So there is the team. I think it is Mas who is related to our readiness to face digital in the index as far as I know." (Personal Interview Tri Mulyono, 07-10-2020).

Indirectly, the journalists of Harian Surya, who were previously established with the print operation mode, experienced disruption and increased workload as a demand from economic interests (advertisers) to continue to produce factual content and get lots of clicks. This efficiency strategy as a form of digital adjustment has also forced many changes in the editorial work of Harian Surya.

"Well, if you say so-and-so, it is down to Mas' reaction that produced the connection, *huh*. It looks like this, so let us first try to eliminate the computers in the office that we prepare a lot for reporters. So reporters usually come to the office, typing in the office, right, reporting in the field. We omitted that, so we no longer provide computers to send to reporters. There is only one for editors and layouts. So it is okay, you can go to the office, but there is room for waiting. He can no longer type in the office, so he is forced to type content in the field using a gadget. Then the second one, we dig up the weapon, give you Mas's cellphone for the field, and give you chat to hold it like that. That is a form of coercion. Even though in the end we also ee for what yes for as a

saver. We did initially have an incentive pattern, *Mas*. So, for example, there is a friend who reaches the target of 7 news a day to go online, from one news to our multimedia, there is an incentive that new journalists are no longer on the pages. The old reporter and one of the strategies, *Mas*, the marketing quotes are already there." (Personal Interview Tri Mulyono, 07-10-2020).

Space efficiency is also implemented in *Harian Surya* with the presence of digitisation. Journalists who initially got a comfortable, adequate and facilitated workspace turned into workers who did not get the workspace. Maximising journalists typing news with their smartphones and working on writing news in the field indirectly saves the media industry's operational costs. The employer, *Harian Surya*, gets efficiency in electricity costs, computer and network maintenance, and workspace. This efficiency comes as an excess of product digitisation and strengthens the cash capital of media owners.

The mass media, in classical Marxist terms, are the 'means of production which in a capitalist society belong to the ruling class (Chandler, 2000). According to the classical Marxist position, the mass media only propagate the ideas and worldviews of the ruling class and deny or stifle alternative ideas. Workers have no bargaining power over the changes and efficiency of the operational mode set by the owners of capital. In this case, *Beky*, a worker from the capitalisation of *Jawa Pos*, is helpless with changes, reductions, and additional work imposed by the ruling class. *Tri Mulyono*, as the Chief Editor of *Surya Daily*, runs the production mode that the owner of the capital has outlined and regulates through incentive control.

According to this attitude, the mass media produces 'false consciousness in the working class. This leads to an extreme stance in which media products are seen as monolithic expressions of ruling class values, ignoring the diversity of values within the ruling class and the media and the possible reading of opposition by media audiences. Incentive schemes given by the authorities are considered as compensation for the loss of workspaces that should be presented. The workers, as a powerless class, eventually become the ones who accept whatever is outlined by the ruler.

As in the confession of the *Surya* journalist, *Mujib Anwar*. As the working class, *Mujib* accepts the line of command and the policy of eliminating these workspaces as something he considers normal because of the demands of the times.

"And the tight competition is like that because that is one way to survive. Everyone is doing that. What is more now, what is the name of the print media, it is not very popular. It is like that. It is different from what it was called a few years before, so it still has to be called a strategy first, but it can still work. Survive by preparing two lifeboats, one of which was the occupancy of all

personnel in the field. Reporters were required to get multi-platforms” – (Personal Interview Mujib Anwar, 16-10-2020).

To be able to survive is the key word that can be underlined in understanding the conditions that occur in this digital shift. Journalists are “forced” to fully enter the field and leave the air-conditioned workspace facilities while typing news. Indirectly, this efficiency is beneficial for media owners because it does not require the provision of space and other facilities (Dahms Fernandez, 2019). In research by Dahms Fernandez, journalists who are forced to be pressed for time and type news in conditions in the field do not optimally write news according to the value of the news. Many things have escaped the journalists’ observations, the prevalence of typos and the possibility of journalists’ opinions being mixed up in the news reportage. This condition resulted in the journalists’ performance no longer being excellent and biased reporting.

“I think everyone accepts it because it is part of the duties and obligations of the personnel, and from the beginning, it was also in quotation marks for doctrine, maybe what is the name of this media vision, so it is a form of vision and mission of the existence of this media, what do you want to play and so on, what is online or Do you also play videos or whatever, of course, all of them see this as a desired development.” (Personal Interview Mujib Anwar, 16-10-2020).

As stated by Mujib Anwar, the helplessness of the working class is finally represented by an attitude of accepting whatever is demanded by the media owners as a consequence of the career choices made by these workers. This attitude is what Dahms Fernandez (2019) conveys as the elimination of the idealism of journalists’ work because of the reductions carried out by the owners of capital (media).

CONCLUSION

The two major mass media companies in Indonesia, namely Kompas Group and Jawa Pos Group, have been successful in mass media, so they can develop media product forms and business models by making their products globalised. Media products published by these two media companies do a lot of product commodification to produce globalised products. Mosco explained that the political economy is divided into three concepts: commodification, spatialisation and globalisation. These two media companies have implemented these concepts to continue to create media innovations and other company products to maintain the company’s existence. This political and economic activity of the media has a negative aspect, for example, the ability of company owners to intervene in government policies to achieve the company’s personal goals. Despite the conglomeration of ownership, these two media companies still demonstrate

professionalism in news content production quality. The media must continue to provide information that is in accordance with the facts without taking sides.

Media groups Kompas Group and Jawa Pos Group have developed media products to produce global products, with news content that uses one source for three types of media technology, namely print, electronic (television, radio) and internet media. The content of the news presented is almost the same in terms of writing, language and news sources. For the development of media products in terms of the quality of news content, the developing technology makes each media crew balance the development of the technology by presenting news which, even though with the same case, can be explained by different sources and education for journalists so that they can write more accurate news.

REFERENCES

- Apjiki. (2019). *Hasil Survei Nasional Penetrasi Pengguna Internet 2018*. <https://apjii.or.id/survei>
- Ashuri, T. (2016). When online news was new: Online technology use and constitution of structures in journalism. *Journalism Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2014.985064>
- Chandler, D. (2000). *Marxist media theory*. Daniel Chandler.
- Chyi, H. I., & Ng, Y. M. M. (2020). Still Unwilling to Pay: An Empirical Analysis of 50 US Newspapers' Digital Subscription Results. *Digital Journalism*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2020.1732831>
- Chyi, H. I., & Tenenboim, O. (2019). Charging More and Wondering Why Readership Declined? A Longitudinal Study of US Newspapers' Price Hikes, 2008–2016. *Journalism Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2019.1568903>
- Creswell, J., & Poth, C. (2017). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. California: Sage publications.
- Curran, J. (2000). *Rethinking Media and Democracy: Mass Media and Society*.
- Dahms Fernandez, N. (2019). *Welfare digitalisation: On dominant narratives in Norwegian media*. University of Stavanger, Norway.
- Daniel, R., & Hagey, K. (2012). *Turning a Page: Newsweek Ends Print Run*. The Wall Street Journal.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2011). *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research* (fourth Edi). SAGE Publications, Inc; Fourth edition (27 April, 2011).
- DetikInet. (2017). *Sederet Media Cetak yang Tutup Lapak*. <https://inet.detik.com/fotoinet/d-3614746/sederet-media-cetak-yang-tutup-lapak/2/#photos>
- Feriyanto, A., & Triana, E. (2015). *Komunikasi Bisnis: Strategi Komunikasi dalam Mengelola Bisnis*. Media Tera.
- Fidler, R. (2003). *Mediamorfosis: Memahami Media Baru*. Bentang Budaya.
- Flew, T. (2013). *FactCheck: does Murdoch own 70% of newspapers in Australia?* The Conversation.
- Fuchs, C., & Mosco, V. (2012). Introduction: Marx is back—the importance of Marxist theory and research for critical communication studies today. *TripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique. Open Access Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society*, 10(2), 127–140.
- Gore, W. (2014). Print running: Newspapers innovating for new audiences. *Index on Censorship*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0306422014549148>
- Gurevitch, M., & Curran, J. (1996). *Mass media and society*. Arnold.
- Ishwara, L. (2011). *Jurnalisme Dasar*. Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Iwilade, A. (2017). From the newspaper to Facebook: New media, intermediality and

- political participation in Africa. In *Voice and Power in Africa's Democracy: Institutions, Participation and Accountability*.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315566092>
- Johns, A. (2015). Recursive Historiographical Work and the Responsibility of the Historian. In *Culture Machine Live*.
- Khadziq, K. (2016). KONVERGENSI MEDIA SURAT KABAR LOKAL (Studi Deskriptif Pemanfaatan Internet Pada Koran Tribun Jogja dalam Membangun Industri Media Cetak Lokal). *Profetik: Jurnal Komunikasi*.
<https://doi.org/10.14421/pjk.v9i1.1187>
- Lotriet, R. (2018). Death of the traditional newspaper: A strategic assessment. *Tydskrif Vir Geesteswetenskappe*, 58(4-1), 716-735.
<https://doi.org/10.17159/2224-7912/2018/v58n4-1a7>
- Michelle, A., & Susilo, D. (2021). The Effect of Instagram Social Media Exposure on Purchase Decision. *ETTISAL: Journal of Communication*, 6(1), 36-50.
- Mosco, V. (2009). *The Political Economy of Communication Second Edition*. London: Sage Publications Lt.
- Neuman, W. (2013). *Metodologi penelitian sosial: Pendekatan kualitatif dan kuantitatif*. PT. Indeks.
- O'Sullivan, J., Fortunati, L., Taipale, S., & Barnhurst, K. (2017). Innovators and innovated: Newspapers and the postdigital future beyond the "death of print." *Information Society*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01972243.2017.1289488>
- Pratopo, W. M., & Kusajibrata, N. (2018). Konvergensi di Ruang Redaksi pada Kelompok Media Tempo. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi (Indonesian Journal of Communications Studies)*. <https://doi.org/10.25139/jsk.v2i1.510>
- Prihartono, A. (2016). Surat Kabar & Konvergensi Media (Studi Deskriptif Kualitatif Model Konvergensi Media Pada Solopos). *Jurnal Channel*, 4, 105-116.
- Pruckner, G. J., & Sausgruber, R. (2013). Honesty on the streets: A field study on newspaper purchasing. *Journal of the European Economic Association*.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/jeea.12016>
- Putranto, T. D. (2019). Wacana Berita PT. Djarum dan Bulu Tangkis Indonesia. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi*. <https://doi.org/10.25139/jsk.v3i1.1052>
- Reily, M. (2017). *Nielsen: Pembaca Media Digital Sudah Lampau Media Cetak*. <https://katadata.co.id/berita/2017/12/07/nielsen-pembaca-media-digital-sudah-lampau-media-cetak>
- Rubawati, E. (2018). Media Baru: Tantangan dan Peluang Dakwah. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi*, 2(1).
- Sunkara, B. (2013). Mengapa ide-ide Karl Marx lebih relevan pada abad ke-21 dibandingkan sebelumnya. *The Guardian*.
- Susilo, D. (2021). *Analisis wacana kritis van dijk: sebuah model dan tinjauan kritis pada media daring*. Unitomo Press.
- Susilo, D, Sugihartati, R., & Arimbi, D. (2019). *Indonesian Women in Politics: Critical Analysis of Portrayal in Online News Sites*.
- Susilo, Daniel, & Putranto, T. (2018). *Indonesian Youth on Social Media: Study on Content Analysis*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/sshr-17.2018.15>
- Susilo, Daniel, Putranto, T., & Navarro, C. (2021). Performance of Indonesian Ministry of Health in Overcoming Hoax About Vaccination Amid the COVID-19 Pandemic on Social Media. *Nyimak: Journal of Communication*, 5(1), 151-166.
- Tapsell, R. (2019). *Kuasa media di Indonesia: Kaum oligarki, warga, dan revolusi digital*. Marjin Kiri.
- Thurman, N., & Fletcher, R. (2018). Are Newspapers Heading Toward Post-Print Obscurity?: A case study of The Independent's transition to online-only. *Digital Journalism*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2018.1504625>
- You, M., Joo, J., Park, E., Noh, G. Y., & Ju, Y. (2017). Emerging Infectious Disease Content in Newspaper Editorials: Public Health Concern or Leadership Issue? *Science Communication*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1075547017705392>